

## **The role of aerosols and greenhouse gases in Sahel drought and recovery: Supplementary material**

**Alessandra Giannini · Alexey Kaplan**

Received: 27 May 2018 / Accepted: 12 November 2018

---

A. Giannini  
International Research Institute for Climate and Society, Earth Institute at Columbia University, 61 Rt 9W, Palisades NY 10964, U.S.A.

A. Kaplan  
Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory, Earth Institute at Columbia University, 61 Rt 9W, Palisades NY 10964, U.S.A.

## Supplementary Material

**Table S1:** Predictors' space characteristics and linear regression results for Sahel rainfall from each individual model's ensemble mean in CMIP5 pre-Industrial control simulations. Columns from left to right show model name, the correlation coefficient,  $\rho$ , of the original predictors ( $x_1$  =GT, global tropical SST mean, and  $x_2$  =NA, sub-tropical North Atlantic SST mean—see Section 1 for the exact definition of these indices), the ratio of their standard deviations,  $k = \sigma_1/\sigma_2$ , angle  $\phi$  from Eq. (3), in arc degree, the relative variance of the trailing mode,  $\lambda_2/(\lambda_1 + \lambda_2)$ , bivariate regression coefficients  $a$  and  $b$  of Sahel rainfall  $y$  (see Section 2 for an exact definition) on the SVD-based predictors  $p_1$  and  $p_2$ , obtained from the original predictors  $x_1$  and  $x_2$ , as described in Eqs. (1)-(4) (see Sections 5.1-5.2 in the Appendix for an explanation and derivations), and the correlation coefficient between  $y$ , Sahel rainfall as simulated in CMIP5, and its predicted values from regression model (6):  $\hat{y} = ap_1 + bp_2$ . Models highlighted in bold font are those whose value in the rightmost column is greater than 0.45, representing 20% of the total variance. Multi-model mean results are included in the last line of the table.

**Table S2:** same as in Table S1, but for the CMIP5 twentieth century/historical simulations. The second column from the left reports the ensemble size.

**Table S3:** same as in Table S1, but for the CMIP5 twenty-first century/RCP8.5 simulations. The second column from the left reports the ensemble size.

**Table S1**

CMIP5/PI-control pre-industrial	$\rho$	$k$	$\phi$ , arc °	$\lambda_2/(\lambda_1 + \lambda_2)$ , %	$a$	$b$	Correlation coefficient of $y$ , $\hat{y}$
ACCESS1-0	0.188	0.946	53.18	40.23	-0.235	0.164	0.286
ACCESS1-3	0.228	1.027	41.66	38.55	-0.312	0.283	0.421
bcc-csm1-1	0.173	0.589	81.31	24.62	-0.004	-0.168	0.168
<b>BNU-ESM</b>	<b>0.317</b>	<b>1.078</b>	<b>38.33</b>	<b>33.75</b>	<b>-0.404</b>	<b>0.244</b>	<b>0.472</b>
CanESM2	0.357	0.939	49.99	31.92	-0.289	0.264	0.391
<b>CCSM4</b>	<b>0.479</b>	<b>1.162</b>	<b>36.25</b>	<b>25.17</b>	<b>-0.360</b>	<b>0.380</b>	<b>0.523</b>
<b>CESM1-CAM5</b>	<b>0.380</b>	<b>0.873</b>	<b>54.88</b>	<b>30.01</b>	<b>-0.207</b>	<b>0.610</b>	<b>0.644</b>
CMCC-CM	0.316	0.778	64.35	30.37	0.141	-0.047	0.149
CNRM-CM5	0.320	0.599	74.57	22.48	0.136	-0.083	0.159
CSIRO-Mk3-6-0	0.440	0.922	50.23	27.69	0.138	0.073	0.156
<b>FGOALS-g2</b>	<b>0.177</b>	<b>0.952</b>	<b>52.81</b>	<b>40.81</b>	<b>-0.244</b>	<b>0.448</b>	<b>0.511</b>
FIO-ESM	0.266	1.292	22.90	32.01	-0.051	-0.166	0.173
GFDL-CM3	0.460	0.951	48.10	26.87	0.358	0.067	0.364
GFDL-ESM2G	0.132	0.824	72.91	38.47	0.185	0.215	0.284
GFDL-ESM2M	0.348	1.156	33.66	31.33	-0.202	0.141	0.246
GISS-E2-H	-0.067	0.989	130.18	46.62	-0.155	0.042	0.160
GISS-E2-R	0.141	0.745	77.38	34.16	0.180	-0.188	0.261
<b>HadGEM2-CC</b>	<b>0.007</b>	<b>0.580</b>	<b>89.63</b>	<b>25.20</b>	<b>0.175</b>	<b>0.533</b>	<b>0.561</b>
<b>HadGEM2-ES</b>	<b>0.107</b>	<b>0.688</b>	<b>82.14</b>	<b>31.47</b>	<b>0.062</b>	<b>0.458</b>	<b>0.462</b>
inmcm4	0.300	0.888	55.85	33.95	-0.163	0.301	0.342
IPSL-CM5A-LR	0.423	0.666	67.32	22.59	0.078	0.250	0.262
IPSL-CM5A-MR	0.452	0.785	59.21	25.02	-0.097	0.426	0.437
IPSL-CM5B-LR	0.398	0.467	77.29	14.47	0.134	-0.264	0.297
MIROC-ESM	0.180	0.668	78.23	29.15	-0.040	0.229	0.232
<b>MIROC5</b>	<b>0.393</b>	<b>1.302</b>	<b>27.90</b>	<b>27.04</b>	<b>-0.533</b>	<b>0.229</b>	<b>0.580</b>
MPI-ESM-LR	0.357	1.074	39.36	31.82	-0.369	0.253	0.447
MPI-ESM-MR	0.342	0.857	57.17	31.45	-0.241	0.312	0.394
MRI-CGCM3	0.115	0.519	85.34	20.85	0.152	0.043	0.158
NorESM1-M	0.352	0.964	47.99	32.30	-0.110	0.197	0.226
<i>Multi-model mean</i>	<i>0.369</i>	<i>0.771</i>	<i>62.75</i>	<i>28.10</i>	<i>0.054</i>	<i>0.312</i>	<i>0.317</i>

Table S2

CMIP5/historical [1900-1999]	ens size	$\rho$	$k$	$\phi$ , arc °	$\lambda_2/(\lambda_1 + \lambda_2)$ , %	$a$	$b$	Correlation coefficient of $y$ , $\hat{y}$
ACCESS1-0	1	0.303	0.735	67.97	29.22	-0.040	0.190	0.194
ACCESS1-3	1	0.299	0.908	53.96	34.36	-0.087	0.223	0.240
bcc-csm1-1	3	0.759	1.054	43.00	11.99	-0.015	0.289	0.290
BNU-ESM	1	0.553	1.144	38.13	21.80	-0.213	0.257	0.334
<b>CanESM2</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0.758</b>	<b>1.186</b>	<b>38.63</b>	<b>11.72</b>	<b>-0.188</b>	<b>0.442</b>	<b>0.480</b>
<b>CCSM4</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>0.920</b>	<b>1.211</b>	<b>39.10</b>	<b>3.85</b>	<b>-0.367</b>	<b>0.488</b>	<b>0.610</b>
<b>CESM1-CAM5</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>0.621</b>	<b>1.086</b>	<b>41.19</b>	<b>18.78</b>	<b>-0.214</b>	<b>0.473</b>	<b>0.520</b>
CMCC-CM	1	0.322	1.027	42.60	33.85	-0.084	-0.112	0.140
CNRM-CM5	10	0.817	0.779	53.57	8.54	0.221	0.242	0.328
CSIRO-Mk3-6-0	10	0.765	0.884	49.59	11.56	-0.051	0.098	0.111
FGOALS-g2	5	0.881	1.150	40.48	5.83	-0.190	0.284	0.341
FIO-ESM	3	0.749	1.276	35.91	11.72	0.040	0.267	0.270
GFDL-CM3	4	0.732	0.847	51.41	13.00	0.297	0.334	0.447
GFDL-ESM2G	1	0.488	0.952	47.90	25.50	-0.244	0.300	0.386
GFDL-ESM2M	1	0.389	1.203	32.24	28.82	-0.192	-0.006	0.192
<b>GISS-E2-H</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0.856</b>	<b>1.278</b>	<b>36.92</b>	<b>6.77</b>	<b>-0.334</b>	<b>0.422</b>	<b>0.538</b>
<b>GISS-E2-R</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0.826</b>	<b>1.197</b>	<b>38.83</b>	<b>8.39</b>	<b>-0.316</b>	<b>0.360</b>	<b>0.479</b>
HadGEM2-CC	1	0.304	0.640	73.29	24.94	0.142	0.323	0.353
HadGEM2-ES	4	0.439	0.554	72.46	17.61	0.297	0.285	0.411
inmcm4	1	0.621	1.020	44.08	18.96	-0.180	0.135	0.225
<b>IPSL-CM5A-LR</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0.901</b>	<b>0.806</b>	<b>51.80</b>	<b>4.72</b>	<b>-0.289</b>	<b>0.395</b>	<b>0.489</b>
<b>IPSL-CM5A-MR</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.675</b>	<b>0.982</b>	<b>45.77</b>	<b>16.23</b>	<b>-0.249</b>	<b>0.431</b>	<b>0.498</b>
IPSL-CM5B-LR	1	0.592	0.616	65.20	15.28	0.223	-0.180	0.286
<b>MIROC-ESM</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>0.462</b>	<b>1.065</b>	<b>41.11</b>	<b>26.75</b>	<b>-0.295</b>	<b>0.467</b>	<b>0.552</b>
<b>MIROC5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0.718</b>	<b>1.027</b>	<b>43.95</b>	<b>14.11</b>	<b>-0.228</b>	<b>0.593</b>	<b>0.635</b>
MPI-ESM-LR	3	0.826	0.833	51.29	8.40	0.072	0.373	0.380
MPI-ESM-MR	3	0.810	0.890	49.12	9.38	0.284	0.137	0.316
<b>MRI-CGCM3</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>0.615</b>	<b>0.670</b>	<b>61.89</b>	<b>15.81</b>	<b>0.403</b>	<b>0.365</b>	<b>0.544</b>
NorESM1-M	3	0.747	0.936	47.53	12.58	-0.162	0.248	0.296
<b>Multi-model mean</b>	<b>29</b>	<b>0.955</b>	<b>1.054</b>	<b>43.42</b>	<b>2.26</b>	<b>-0.320</b>	<b>0.477</b>	<b>0.574</b>

**Table S3**

CMIP5/RCP8.5 [2006-2099]	ens size	$\rho$	$k$	$\phi$ , arc °	$\lambda_2/(\lambda_1 + \lambda_2)$ , %	$a$	$b$	Correlation coefficient of $y, \hat{y}$
ACCESS1-0	1	0.974	1.104	42.09	1.27	0.186	0.196	0.270
ACCESS1-3	1	0.982	1.112	41.91	0.87	0.088	0.070	0.112
bcc-csm1-1	1	0.959	1.051	43.51	2.07	-0.101	0.142	0.174
<b>BNU-ESM</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.960</b>	<b>0.911</b>	<b>47.78</b>	<b>2.00</b>	<b>0.639</b>	<b>0.309</b>	<b>0.709</b>
CanESM2	5	0.994	1.069	43.07	0.29	0.173	0.236	0.292
<b>CCSM4</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>0.994</b>	<b>1.150</b>	<b>40.98</b>	<b>0.32</b>	<b>0.613</b>	<b>0.081</b>	<b>0.619</b>
CESM1-CAM5	3	0.991	1.173	40.42	0.41	0.188	0.392	0.435
CMCC-CM	1	0.978	1.031	44.12	1.08	-0.147	0.216	0.262
<b>CNRM-CM5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0.990</b>	<b>0.978</b>	<b>45.63</b>	<b>0.49</b>	<b>0.520</b>	<b>0.105</b>	<b>0.531</b>
<b>CSIRO-Mk3-6-0</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>0.997</b>	<b>1.089</b>	<b>42.54</b>	<b>0.13</b>	<b>-0.933</b>	<b>0.078</b>	<b>0.936</b>
<b>FGOALS-g2</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.976</b>	<b>0.683</b>	<b>55.89</b>	<b>1.04</b>	<b>0.707</b>	<b>0.169</b>	<b>0.727</b>
FIO-ESM	3	0.965	1.624	31.21	1.37	-0.134	0.121	0.181
<b>GFDL-CM3</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.984</b>	<b>0.935</b>	<b>46.97</b>	<b>0.82</b>	<b>0.607</b>	<b>0.259</b>	<b>0.660</b>
GFDL-ESM2G	1	0.951	0.948	46.62	2.45	-0.224	0.007	0.225
GFDL-ESM2M	1	0.945	0.975	45.76	2.76	-0.232	-0.025	0.233
GISS-E2-H	1	0.971	1.125	41.53	1.42	-0.314	0.305	0.438
<b>GISS-E2-R</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0.973</b>	<b>1.236</b>	<b>38.82</b>	<b>1.30</b>	<b>-0.556</b>	<b>0.318</b>	<b>0.640</b>
HadGEM2-CC	3	0.978	1.074	42.90	1.11	0.252	0.300	0.391
HadGEM2-ES	4	0.989	1.118	41.76	0.56	-0.084	0.366	0.375
inmcm4	1	0.967	1.036	43.96	1.65	-0.001	0.085	0.085
IPSL-CM5A-LR	4	0.995	1.085	42.64	0.24	-0.089	0.293	0.306
IPSL-CM5A-MR	1	0.982	1.116	41.80	0.87	-0.051	0.225	0.231
IPSL-CM5B-LR	1	0.955	0.840	50.21	2.18	0.199	-0.127	0.236
<b>MIROC-ESM</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.973</b>	<b>0.939</b>	<b>46.86</b>	<b>1.36</b>	<b>0.636</b>	<b>0.123</b>	<b>0.648</b>
<b>MIROC5</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>0.963</b>	<b>0.989</b>	<b>45.33</b>	<b>1.87</b>	<b>0.450</b>	<b>0.622</b>	<b>0.768</b>
MPI-ESM-LR	3	0.988	1.028	44.20	0.59	-0.019	0.000	0.019
MPI-ESM-MR	1	0.965	1.064	43.16	1.76	0.201	0.347	0.401
MRI-CGCM3	1	0.962	0.927	47.25	1.90	0.241	0.158	0.288
<b>NorESM1-M</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.953</b>	<b>1.038</b>	<b>43.88</b>	<b>2.34</b>	<b>0.431</b>	<b>0.344</b>	<b>0.552</b>
<b>Multi-model mean</b>	<b>29</b>	<b>0.999</b>	<b>1.043</b>	<b>43.79</b>	<b>0.04</b>	<b>0.783</b>	<b>0.171</b>	<b>0.801</b>